

THE LARGE GLASS

No. 25 / 26, 2018

journal of contemporary art,
culture and theory

ISSN 1409-5823



9 771409 582008

The Large Glass No. 25 / 26, 2018
(Journal of Contemporary Art, Culture and Theory)

Published twice a year. Price for a single copy 500 MKD, Annual
subscription: 1000 MKD

Publisher: Museum of Contemporary Art Skopje
Address: Samoilova 17, MK - 1000 Skopje
Tel: (++) 389 2 110 123
E-mail: info@msu.mk
Web site: www.msu.mk

Director: Mira Gakina

Editor-in-Chief: Tihomir Topuzovski

Editorial Board: Zoran Petrovski, Jovanka Popova, Melentie Pandilovski,
Slavco Dimitrov, Yane Calovski, Artan Sadiku, Hristina Ivanoska and
Ljiljana Nedelkovska

Layout: Private Print

Printed by: Feniks Print, Kocani

Copyediting/proofreading: Matt Jones

Copies: 1000

The postage fee for sending the magazines abroad is charged according
to the current price list of Post of Macedonia and is paid when the
subscription is purchased.

ISSN: 1409 - 5823

Financially supported by the Ministry of
Culture of the Republic of Macedonia



The Large Glass is being published again 23 years after its first issue and ten years since its last issue. The journal was first launched in 1995 by Sonja Abadzhieva, who became editor-in-chief, working with Liljana Nedelkovska, Zoran Petrovski, Marika Bocvarovska and many other collaborators to create a journal of art reviews and criticism.

The journal expanded on the initial ambition of the Skopje Museum of Contemporary Art (MoCA) to radiate new ideas and maintain the highest ethical and professional standards, but also signified a new beginning of constant reassessment through criticism and analysis of contemporary art.

With this relaunch it is crucial we are showing that the termination of *The Large Glass* was only temporary and that the pause has only served to complement its history - fractured like the artwork from which it derives its title: Duchamp's *The Large Glass*. For this reason we have decided to mark this new beginning with focus on the current social challenges.

The Large Glass will act as one of the essential mediums of MoCA for the presentation, analysis and discussion of a wide range of current challenges and topics in culture, art and theory. Publishing the journal in English will also give the MoCA the opportunity to reach a wider range of creative and international environments and take part in other cultural, artistic and academic communities. This will extend the international recognition and cooperation of the Museum.

This commitment to contemporary art and international trends in art and criticism is in line with the original ideals and establishment of the MoCA, which was founded in 1964 as a modern museum fully engaged in dialogue with international authors and with a focus on the ever-changing challenges in the sphere of culture and art.

The revitalization of *The Large Glass* as a venture should confirm the reputation of MoCA Skopje as an institution with significant experience and a publisher in the area of contemporary art and critical thought.

Mira Gakina
Director of the Museum of Contemporary Art in Skopje

The Large Glass

No. 25/26, 2018

CONTENT:

3
Tihomir Topuzovski: Introduction - Reinventing the Horizon of Visibility

Artistic practices and Political Imagination

6
Kim Charnley: Activist Art and Visibility after Brexit

13
Stephen Duncombe: The Power of the Imaginary in Activist Arts

19
Reassessing Socially Engaged Artistic Practices - Interview with Grant Kester by Tihomir Topuzovski

25
Grant Kester: On the Relationship between Theory and Practice in Socially Engaged Art

Portrait Ai Weiwei

29
The Politics of Shame - Ai Weiwei in conversation with Anthony Downey

39
Ai Weiwei: ‘Mirror’, FOMU Antwerp

43
Maja Ćirić: ‘Comrades’ & ‘Gentlemen’ - Contemporary Forms of Activism in the Balkans (The case of Belgrade)

48
Bojan Ivanov: On the Current Thematizations of Crisis in the Social Superstructure

51
Rena Rädle & Vladan Jeremić: Fragile Presence, Time for Movement

56
MTL COLLECTIVE: From Institutional Critique to Institutional Liberation? A Decolonial Perspective on the Crises of Contemporary Art

77
Steve Lambert: Capitalism

82
Dimitry Vielnsky: We Have a Situation Here...

87
Elena Veljanovska: “Mastering the Art of Conviviality” - The work methodology of the art collective *Chto delat?* (‘What is to be done?’)

Cover: Forensic Architecture, Rafah Master Drawing (detail), Pléiades satellite photograph of eastern Rafah, taken on 1 August 2014 at 11:39 am. This master drawing of Rafah includes: viewpoints and plume measurements from every photograph and video sourced; craters from airdropped bombs and artillery as observed on the satellite images; tank paths and armored vehicles on the move; reference points; location of possible tunnels; and the trajectories described in testimonies by civilians in the strip.

Engaged Visual Methodologies, Unearthing Data and Memories

91
Eyal Weizman: Forensic Aesthetics

96
Forensic Architecture: Unearthing State Violence

106
Milica Tomić, Branimir Stojanović: Towards a Matheme of Genocide

116
Damir Arsenijević: Grupa Spomenik - Repeating the Disso-ciation

118
Ana Hoffner: The Queerness of Memory

The Spatiliaties of Inconsistency

128
Coco Fusco: Empty Plaza 2012

132
Ben Gravile: Quotations of Chairman Mao (part 1)

136
Kumjana Novakova: To Resist: The Dream of a Ridiculous Man

139
Johannes Gierlinger: Voyeurs of the Utopian through a Resisting Body

160
The MoCa’s Exhibition - All That We Have in Common

165
Contributors

Tihomir Topuzovski

Introduction

Reinventing the Horizon of Visibility

Conceiving a vision of a different society, inventing new modes of ethical, political and aesthetic dimensions, is an increasingly difficult but pressing challenge. Artists are exceptional in this regard insofar as they demonstrate an intersection of creative routes and the formation of alternative visions. Artists have long taken an active role both in demonstrating their connections with social movements and political activism and in producing new imaginaries. The importance of such artistic practices can begin to be grasped when we consider what artists are already doing in terms of reinventing possibilities and generating new forms and knowledge - not only what we have already learnt but what we can still learn from their experiences, successes and failures. Working outside of established ‘common sense’, disputing and disrupting what is ‘visible’, artists express their strong disagreement and resistance to current conditions and alter our perceptions and understanding of a politically marked spatiality. They act in a field where ‘politics is first of all a battle about perceptible and sensible material’¹ - one that revolves around what can be seen and sensed and by which politics is brought to visibility, so that it ‘renders an object, event, practice, or person at once visible and available for accountability.’² The horizon of visibility in this context is shaped and framed by power relations: ‘Foucault illustrates that during different historical periods, distinct modes of visibility are produced by power in order to control society.’³ Hence state authorities and powerful bodies often develop the technology of a disciplinary order, or in Rancière’s words a ‘distribution of the sensible’, in order to impose their regime over visibility and modes of perception - a regime that ‘provides the political life of sensation.’⁴ This is enforced by decisions, policies and values driven by governing and powerful bodies. This leads us directly to Berkeley’s claim that ‘to be is to be perceived’⁵ - or in the specific thematic discussion that what is perceived in a society is associated with an ‘ontological ground’, or in this context into existence within the social sensorium.

The argument can be supported with examples of artists’ joint practices and modes of re-configuring sensory experiences, which enable some subject-agents to regulate what is visible and what is not. These practices counter and resist predominant political trends, whatever the political mainstream may be, through various forms of direct intervention. These acts can be delineated as ways and methods aimed at something arbitrarily below a social horizon of visibility, or else at provoking issues proscribed in relation to it. This calls for and entails the creation of a new vision, for perceiving new contours and participating and constructing moments beyond and counter to regimes of appraisal that ‘customarily organize the world, compelling us to have to reconfigure our own postures’⁶ in opposition to the world as it is. It includes reflections that provide an innovative and comprehensive understanding of the role of art, which in radical instances achieves ‘a collapse of the representational paradigm, which means not only the collapse of a hierarchical system of address; it means the collapse of a whole regime of meaning’.⁷

Accordingly, the main thematic scope of this edition of *The Large Glass* is that of activist art as a form of political protest. It is a common practice in urban landscapes, manifested in various actions, from the occupation of buildings to the use of walls for displaying messages, creating resistance that transforms public spaces. Examples include artists protesting in key public spaces to raise the visibility of certain communities such as refugees forced to leave their homes ‘because of war, environmental waste, and famine, marginalized and simultaneously subjected to a new form of slave exploitation’⁸ at a time when, as Berardi points out: ‘the massive internment of migrant workers in detention centers disseminated all over the European territory dispels the illusion that the “camp” has been wiped out from the world.’⁹ The level of complexity of these artistic practices can be interpreted as a result of their being attempts to reassess the current visual horizon and to challenge existing boundaries of spaces of power. To some extent these efforts constitute a critique of museums and galleries as tools that serve to maintain the capitalist system and the ways in which capitalism commodifies artworks and instrumentalises artists. Some examples recently made public seem to be the subject of great attention, such as cases where collective artistic groups and individuals have attempted to decolonise the domain of museums through direct interventions. This

my position in its entirety.

Being an art critic lacking knowledge, my preference is for artists devoid of art. Who are those artists I am referring to and what are they doing?

Well, in brief, these artists are my people - the only people I am interested in knowing better. Their interest, on the other hand, is either in attending to the production of a contemporary political space or in bringing about cultural strategies for the production of social goals - or both. Come to think of it - political space, social goals - may well be the only redeeming features of modernity at this time. Moreover, those art-less artist may just now be the only ones holding the answers to the questions that lie ahead of us.□

References

1. ‘COLD WALL - A collective answer on fences and men’ was a collective exhibition by Ferenc Gróf, Vladan Jeremić, Rena Rädle and Volodymyr Kuznetsov, curated by Róna Kopeczky at the Studio of Young Artists’ Gallery in Budapest in November 2015.
2. ‘This is not a fence’, an artistic commentary by Vladan Jeremić and Rena Rädle, was displayed in the entrance hall of the Museum of Contemporary Art Metelkova in Ljubljana from June 18-August 21 2016.
3. ‘COLD WALL / HLADNI ZID - A collective answer on fences and men’ was a collectively organized exhibition by Ferenc Gróf, Rena Rädle, Vladan Jeremić, Volodymyr Kuznetsov, Babi Badalov, the *škart* collective and Róna Kopeczkyat at the Museum of Contemporary Art of Vojvodina, Novi Sad, in July 2016, with the participation of activists from the refugee solidarity movement.
4. Forum di Arte e Cultura Kontemporanea (F.A.C.K.) is a mobile platform experimenting with self-organized programmes at institutions of art and culture. <http://www.msuv.org/program/2016-08-01-fack-msuv-eng.php>
5. ‘Fragile Presence - Action Space’ was part of the *Guerrilla of Enlightenment* exhibition held in two phases in June-August 2018 and in September-November 2018), commissioned by the <rotor> Center for Contemporary Art in Graz, Austria, and curated by Anton Lederer and Margarethe Makovec.

Rena Rädle & Vladan Jeremić

Fragile Presence, Time for Movement

Today, with the neoliberal trimming of public institutions of art, artistic work has become an entrepreneurial activity within a restrictive framework that is conditioned by the exploding art market, creative industries and the political agendas of governments prescribing a certain canon of art.

The question of how to organize the (re)production, distribution and reception of art beyond the frameworks of the market and reactionary art institutions is crucial to art practices that support emancipatory directions of change. From the viewpoint of artistic practice as a means of social transformation, this can only be done in coalition and cooperation with others - with groups, organizations and entities that want to bring forward emancipatory change in society. Such artistic practice is not hermetic but in interaction with the surroundings in which it is created, and its value is measurable insofar as the work is recognized by others as a relevant contribution to a certain cause, i.e. as an articulation of a demand within the society.

In this essay we will describe our artistic practice in the context of the refugee solidarity movement, including self-organized collective exhibitions, works commissioned by art institutions, and protest actions. We will show how art can contribute to the visual language of a new collectivity and how art can become a means of empowerment and solidarity by creating time and space for collaboration and collective action.

When large numbers of refugees arrived in Serbia in 2015, solidarity groups

were formed to provide clothes, food and other assistance. Many people helped with assisting refugees to get shelter and medical help, or simply spent time together organizing joint activities like cooking, sports, concerts, films and visits to exhibitions, as well as making friends with people on the move. A network developed among local people, migrants and activists from all over Europe along the Balkan route.

In autumn 2015, together with other artist friends and a curator, we organized an exhibition called ‘COLD WALL’ at the Studio of Young Artists’ Gallery in Budapest.¹ This exhibition focused on Hungary’s recent closure of its border to refugees travelling from Serbia. A second exhibition followed in Ljubljana at the Museum of Contemporary Art Metelkova² when Slovenia fenced off its border in the same way as Hungary had done. At the Museum of Contemporary Art in Novi Sad, artists and solidarity groups organized a third COLD WALL exhibition in 2016.³ This was both extended and transformed by the participants of ‘NEW mUSEum F.A.C.K.’ as part of an experiment at the Novi Sad museum in how to make use of a cultural institution.⁴ Within the frame of this event, the group called for a ‘F.A.C.K. borders meeting’ to be held in support of migrants and against the policy of closed borders. The group discussed how to use the museum in ways that might be useful for their struggle and activities, including networking, work meetings, discussions, workshops, performances, projections, presentations and assemblies. Later on, activists used

the visual materials created for the exhibition in a solidarity action held in a park in Belgrade where most of the migrants were camped at that time.

For the 2016 October Salon exhibition in Belgrade we made a large wall painting with cardboard sculptures and takeaway newspapers scattered across the space. This work, which we called ‘Fragile Presence’, is a visual interpretation of the March of Hope that took place in late summer 2015 when migrants set off on foot from a train station in Budapest to the German border. That long journey was taken to escape the threat of being detained in camps, and so ‘Fragile Presence’ shows scenes of liberation from the camps and a central composition with people breaking through the walls of ‘Fortress Europe’. This breakthrough depicts the moment when a new collectivity is brought about that succeeds in overcoming obstacles in spite of its own fragility - the moment when the dynamic of human bodies breaks down the border regime of the European Union. This movement of refugees creates its own time that transcends local temporalities. Their struggle becomes part of other struggles that likewise seek to occupy, open up and transform space against the linear chronologies of restriction and oppression.

The reception of the people migrating on the March of Hope was made possible by an extensive network of solidarity along the route and among the host communities. In the years since that journey was taken, state-organized structures have taken control of managing migration and the issue is now brutally instrumentalised in election campaigns by right-wing politicians. Today, parties of the New Right have established themselves in parliaments throughout Europe, gaining votes through xenophobic propaganda and the spread of fascist conspiracy theories. In their countries of refuge, migrants are physically attacked by fascist vigilante groups. New Right governments actively seek to criminalize organizations or individuals helping refugees through juridical means.

This is why, when we were invited in June 2018 to develop a space for meetings and workshops at the <rotor> Center



Protest. Credits: Christian Punzen Gruber



Protest Action Graz. Credits: Rena Raedle



Oslobodjenje. credits: Thomas Raggam.

for Contemporary Art⁶ in Graz, Austria, we decided to create sculptures related to the struggle for solidarity as monuments of resistance and liberation. The space, called ‘Fragile Presence - Action Space’, was designed as a space of solidarity and empowerment in which people could gather to discuss and organize against the ongoing anti-humanist, anti-egalitarian, anti-feminist and anti-democratic turn in our societies. The space can be transformed by its users, as the sculptures can be disassembled to serve as chairs and tables during meetings and other activities.

Several months later, as part of an exhibition in the framework of *steirischer herbst* at <rotor>, we created a series of banners and posters with slogans in the space in preparation for a protest action in the city. Banners and flags have long been attributes of societal institutions and organizations, whether political, religious, social or economic. They symbolize the ideological and political power of a group in a moment of struggle. The images we created for the banners were our contribution to the iconography of a social movement that is forming a new collectivity. They represent stories, collective experiences, performances and knowledge that are meaningful for migrants and the refugee solidarity movement. We say a ‘new collectivity’ because this collective is not being formed through identitarian concepts such as nation, culture, ethnicity, gender, and claims on individual rights. Instead it overcomes the individualization and fragmentation of life and working relations imposed by today’s methods of production and shows how new transnational alliances are formed through the unjust distribution of work and wealth in the world.

On 24 September 2018 we organised an hour-long action in front of the main station in Graz together with <rotor> and local artists and activists, protesting against the criminalization of solidarity with refugees. For this protest we tied together the banners and posters we’d prepared at the workshop and spread them across the whole square. A speech was given and everybody joined in,

shouting slogans like “Saving lives is not a crime!” and “Stop the causes of war!”. Although we were relatively few in number, our artistic protest action made a clear and powerful statement. We hope we encouraged people in Graz to keep on protesting and publicly condemning inhuman policies towards refugees, especially at a time when right-wing ideology is becoming normalized in public opinion in Austria.

To conclude, we see our practice as having contributed to various interlinked fields of struggle. One of these is the field of artistic representation, where our work developed an iconography of refugee solidarity - a visual language that is part of and meaningful to this movement. This leads to the field of the distribution of art work and the participation of others in its creation and reception. Here we seek to make our art accessible and reproducible in non-white cube situations by using flags, banners, newspapers, printed reproductions and usable objects, etc.

Institutions do also have an important role to play in the distribution of art. Their function first needs to be reshaped, however, since institutions have largely become disconnected from social and political life. In the meantime, producing politically clearly articulated works within art institutions can help open them up for the causes of social movements.□

References

1. ‘COLD WALL - A collective answer on fences and men’ was a collective exhibition by Ferenc Gróf, Vladan Jeremić, Rena Rädle and Volodymyr Kuznetsov, curated by Róna Kopeczky at the Studio of Young Artists’ Gallery in Budapest in November 2015.
2. ‘This is not a fence’, an artistic commentary by Vladan Jeremić and Rena Rädle, was displayed in the entrance hall of the Museum of Contemporary Art Metlkova in Ljubljana from June 18-August 21 2016.
3. ‘COLD WALL / HLADNI ZID - A collective answer on fences and men’ was a collectively organized exhibition by Ferenc Gróf, Rena Rädle, Vladan Jeremić, Volodymyr Kuznetsov, Babi Badalov, the *škart* collective and Róna Kopeczkyat at the Museum of Contemporary Art of Vojvodina, Novi Sad, in July 2016, with the participation of activists from the refugee

solidarity movement.

4. Forum di Arte e Cultura Kontemporanea (F.A.C.K.) is a mobile platform experimenting with self-organized programmes at institutions of art and culture. <http://www.msuv.org/program/2016-08-01-fack-msuv-eng.php>

5. ‘Fragile Presence - Action Space’ was part of the *Guerrilla of Enlightenment* exhibition held in two phases in June-August 2018 and in September-November 2018), commissioned by the <rotor> Center for Contemporary Art in Graz, Austria, and curated by Anton Lederer and Margarethe Makovec.



above: Postavka. credits: Thomas Raggam.

below: Discussion action space. credits: Rotor.